Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

#### Tropical Geometry and Mechanism Design arXiv 1606.04880

Robert A. Crowell

Hausdorff Center for Mathematics, University of Bonn

September 07, 2017

joint with Ngoc M. Tran (UT Austin, HCM Bonn)

Prepared for: OR 2017, Berlin

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments 000000

# Section 1

# Mechanisms and Tropical Linear Algebra of Incentive Compatibility

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

# Economic Model - Mechanisms

# Setup: $m \in \mathbb{N}$ outcomes, there is a single player with type-space $T \subset \mathbb{R}^m$ .

The player has a true type  $t \in T$ , determined by nature. Coordinate  $t_j$  measures the value of outcome j. Only the agent knows t, "private information".

#### Definition

A **mechanism** is a pair (g, p) with an outcome function  $g: T \to [m]$ , and a payment vector  $p \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .

Geometry of Payments 000000

### Incentive Compatibility

A mechanism (g, p) induces a game.

- Strategy is a report: t 
  ightarrow r(t), with  $r(t) \in T$
- Game's outcome:  $g(r) \in [m]$  and a payment  $p_{g(r)} \in \mathbb{R}$ .

The agent chooses a strategy to maximize his utility

$$r(t) \in \arg \max_{r \in T} \{(t-p)_{g(r)}\}$$
 for all  $t \in T$ .

#### Definition

A mechanism (g, p) is incentive compatible (IC) if

$$t_{g(t)} - p_{g(t)} \geq t_{g(r)} - p_{g(r)}$$

for all  $t, r \in T$ .

## Tropical Linear Algebra of IC

 $(\mathbb{R}, \underline{\oplus}, \odot)$  min-plus semi-ring:  $a\underline{\oplus}b = \min\{a, b\}$ ,  $a \odot b = a + b$ .

Given an outcome function  $g: T \rightarrow [m]$ , define the matrix  $L^g$ :

$$L_{ij}^g = \inf_{t \in g^{-1}(i)} \{t_i - t_j\} \text{ for all } i, j \in [m].$$

 $(\underline{\lambda}(L^g), p) \in \mathbb{R} \times \mathbb{R}^m$  is a min-plus eigenpair if

$$L^{g} \underline{\odot} p = \underline{\lambda}(L^{g}) \underline{\odot} p.$$

#### Theorem (Rochet, Cuninghame-Green) A mechanism (g, p) is IC if and only if $L^{g} \odot p = p$ . In other words, (g, p) is IC if and only if (0, p) is an eigenpair of $L^{g}$ .

Geometry of Mechanisms •000000 Geometry of Payments 000000

< □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > < □ > <

# Section 2

# Geometry of Mechanisms

In the following assume that  $|T| = r < \infty$  and 'generic'.

 $(\mathbb{R}, \underline{\oplus}, \odot)$  min-plus semi-ring:  $a\underline{\oplus}b = \min\{a, b\}$ ,  $a \odot b = a + b$ .  $(\mathbb{R}, \overline{\oplus}, \odot)$  max-plus semi-ring:  $a\overline{\oplus}b = \max\{a, b\}$ ,  $a \odot b = a + b$ .

Geometry of Payments

#### Tropical Convex Geometry I

Tropical affine space  $\mathbb{TP}^{m-1} := \mathbb{R}^m / \sim$  with

$$(x_1,\ldots,x_m)=x\sim x\odot a=(x_1+a,\ldots,x_m+a)$$

Min-plus hyperplane with apex t is

$$\underline{\mathcal{H}}(-t) = \Big\{ q \in \mathbb{TP}^{m-1} : \exists i \neq j \text{ with } q_i - t_i = q_j - t_j = \min_{k \in [m]} \{ q_k - t_k \} \Big\},$$

For a subset  $I \subset [m]$ , the halfspace of type I with apex t is

$$\underline{\mathcal{H}}_{I}(-t) = \left\{ q \in \mathbb{TP}^{m-1} : q_{i} - t_{i} = \min_{k \in [m]} \{ q_{k} - t_{k} \} \forall i \in I \right\}$$

 $\underline{\mathcal{H}}(-T)$  is tropical hyperplane arrangement.

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments

#### Tropical Convex Geometry II



Figure : Tropical hyperplanes

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments 000000

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

#### Tropical Convex Geometry III



Figure : A min-plus arrangement on three points.

## Covectors and Combinatorics of Arrangements

**Covectors** encode combinatorics of arrangement  $\underline{\mathcal{H}}(-T)$ ,  $\underline{\operatorname{coVec}}_{T}(q) \in \{0,1\}^{m \times r}$ , with

$$\underline{\operatorname{coVec}}_{\mathcal{T}}(q)_{it} = 1 \quad \Leftrightarrow \quad q \in \underline{\mathcal{H}}_i(-t).$$

For a bipartite graph g on  $[m] \times T$ , define

$$\mathcal{P}(g) := \{q \in \mathbb{TP}^{m-1} : q \in \underline{\mathcal{H}}_i(-t) \text{ for all } (i,t) \in g\}$$
  
 $= \{q \in \mathbb{TP}^{m-1} : t \in \overline{\mathcal{H}}_i(-q) \text{ for all } (i,t) \in g\}$ 

If  $\mathcal{P}(g) \neq \emptyset$ , then all points in relative interior have same covector  $\nu(g)$ , called the **basic covector** of g.

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments 000000

#### Basic cells

#### Definition

A covector  $\nu$  is **basic** if  $\nu = \nu(g)$  for some surjective outcome function. Call  $\mathcal{P}(\nu)$  a **basic cell**.

#### Theorem

A surjective mechanism (g, p) is IC if and only if  $p \in P$  for some basic cell P and  $g \leq \underline{coVec}_T(P)$ . Moreover, the cell  $P(\nu(g))$  consists of all supporting payments.

#### Theorem

If T is finite and generic, then the basic cells are precisely the full-dimensional, bounded cells of  $\underline{\mathcal{H}}(-T)$ .

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへぐ

### Geometric construction of Mechanisms



Figure : Geometric construction of an IC mechanism

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments •00000

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへぐ

# Section 3

# Geometry and Algebra of IC

Geometry of Payments

## Generators of the Eigenspace

Let  $g: T \to [m]$  be IC. Recall

$$L_{ij}^{\mathbf{g}} = \inf_{t \in \mathbf{g}^{-1}(i)} \{t_i - t_j\}$$
 for all  $i, j \in [m]$ .

The tropical eigenspace is the set

$$\underline{\mathsf{Eig}}(L^g) = \{ p \in \mathbb{TP}^{m-1} : L^g \underline{\odot} p = p \}$$

Define:

$$\underline{\operatorname{Eig}}_{0}(L^{g}) := \bigcap_{i=1}^{m} \underline{\mathcal{H}}_{i}(-L_{i,\bullet})$$

Theorem If g is IC, then  $\operatorname{Eig}_{0}(L^{g})$  is the set of IC payments.

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments

## Geometry of IC payments



(a) Generic types labeled by a mechanism

(b) The geometry of IC payments

◆□▶ ◆□▶ ◆臣▶ ◆臣▶ 臣 のへぐ

Geometry of Payments 000000

## Some Consequences

A mechanism (g, p) is **Revenue Equivalen** (RE) if there is a unique IC payments  $p \in \mathbb{TP}^{m-1}$ .

Classical property helpful to find revenue maximal mechanisms. Tropical geometry provides interpretation and another strategy.

- Tropical view of RE:
  - Geometrically: associated basic cell consists of exactly one point, C. and Tran 2016
  - Algebraically: pairwise tropical linear dependence. (cf. Heydenreich et. al., Econometrica 2009)
- In the absence of RE: "extremal payments" (Kos and Messner, JET 2013) correspond to faces of basic cell supported by  $[(0, -1, \ldots, -1)]$  and  $[(0, 1, \ldots, 1)]$ .
- Easy algorithm to find **revenue maximizing** mechanisms. Calculate expected revenue for each cell (using price in the face supported by [(0,1,...,1)]). Then maximize over cells.

Geometry of Mechanisms

Geometry of Payments

## Geometry of RE

One can handle infinite and non-generic type-spaces via approximation.



(a) A finite approximation of T with five points and its min-plus arrangement.



(b) The basic cells T in gray.

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

Figure : Infinite type space via approximations

Geometry of Payments

▲ロト ▲帰 ト ▲ ヨ ト ▲ ヨ ト ・ ヨ ・ の Q ()

## Further Results and Concludsion

Geometric theory of mechanism design and an algebraic understanding of IC payments.

Further results.

- 1. Full characterization of all IC mechanisms, for non-generic and infinite arrangements.
- 2. Extension to multiple players.
- 3. For a given type-space *T*, characterization of all matrices *L* that are generating sets of an IC mechanism supported on *T*.
- 4. Geometric criterion for the dimension of the Eigenspace.